Impact of training on front liners performance: Moderating effect of job satisfaction

Citra Putri Nurani ^(a), Noermijati ^(b), Rofiaty ^(c)

^(a,b,c) Management Department, Faculty of Economic and Business, Universitas Brawijaya, Indonesia.

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 19 August 2020

Received in rev. form 02 Sept. 2020

Accepted 05 September 2020

Keywords:

Training, Employee Performance, Job Satisfaction

JEL Classification:

M53, J24, J28

ABSTRACT

The context of this study focused on the role of training in improving employee performance through job satisfaction on front liners of PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk, Malang City. This study aimed to determine and analyze the effect of training on employee performance, both directly and indirectly, through the mediation of job satisfaction. The sample used in this study was employees who work as Front Liners, which were divided into Customer Service Representative (CSR) and Smartfren Gadget Specialist (SGS). The sample in this study included in saturated sampling was a sampling technique if all the population members were used as samples. The sample was 105 respondents. The analytical method used was descriptive analysis and Partial Least Square (PLS) using the WarpPLS software application version 6.0. This study's results indicated that training has a significant effect on job satisfaction and employee performance, and mediation testing showed that job satisfaction provides a partial mediation role on the effect of training on employee performance. Further researchers need to consider a broader scope of research objects, both on the same research object and a larger scale, to enrich the results and research findings. This study also uses only a few indicators to reflect existing variables, so that further researchers can expand and integrate the research model by including several.

© 2020 by the authors. Licensee SSBFNET, Istanbul, Turkey. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

Introduction

The organization will not function without human intervention, who is the primary driver of the running of the organizational system. So quality human resources are one of the determinants of whether a company is good or bad. In other words, employees are assets, and the central element in the organization plays a very decisive role in achieving organizational goals. There are still gaps in the services provided by Front Liners, which cause customers to complain about essential services and product usage. Front Liners do not inform the customer about how to use the product in detail so that the customer feels that the information he gets is not following the actual conditions of use in the field. In terms of essential services, there are still some customers who complain due to dissatisfaction due to impolite service such as the rudeness of Front Liners who want to end service quickly, are not friendly, and so on.

Until now, there have been many studies on employee performance training. The results of research (Ifenkwe, 2012; Kraja, 2015; Rustiana, 2010; Sasidaran, 2018; Sendawula, Kimuli, Bananuka, & Muganga, 2018; Park & Kang, 2017) state that training has a significant effect on employee performance. Meanwhile, according to research (Aragon, Jiménez, & Valle, 2014; MburuMaina & Waithaka, 2017) state that training does not have a significant effect on employee performance.

The inconsistency of the results in previous studies led researchers to re-identify the factors that affect employee performance other than training (Robbins & Judge, 2017). explain from a review of 300 studies that there is a strong correlation between job satisfaction and performance. When looking at the context of moving from the individual to the organizational level, one finds support for the satisfaction and performance relationship. The results of the research (Fadlallh, 2015; Ayundasari, Sudiro, & Irawanto, 2017; Günay, 2018; Inuwa, 2017) state that job satisfaction has a significant effect on employee performance.

* Corresponding author. ORCID ID: 0000-0002-3103-7733

© 2020 by the authors. Hosting by SSBFNET. Peer review under responsibility of Center for Strategic Studies in Business and Finance.

<https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v9i5.841>

Based on the linkages described above, the researcher tries to close the gap on the inconsistency of the results between training and personality on employee performance by looking at the relationship between the two and job satisfaction. The results of the study (Hanaysha & Tahir, 2016; Kelemu, Sime, & Zalalam, 2015; Msuya et al., 2017) state that training has a significant effect on job satisfaction. By finding a link between job satisfaction and employee performance and a significant relationship between training variables and job satisfaction, the researchers made job satisfaction a variable that mediates the relationship between training and employee performance.

The provision of training and job satisfaction of workers is something that should be considered by PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk, especially in Malang City because these two factors can have an impact on employee performance, making employees more likely to produce maximum effort and contribute to achieving common goals.

This research conducted in PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk to 105 Front Liners employees, data were collected using a questionnaire. The reminder of this study is organized as follows. The next section provides a review of extant literature. The third section introduces methodology and data. Finally, conclusions and implications of the study are presented in the final section.

Literature Review

Relationship of Training to Employee Performance

Research on the effect of training on employee performance has also been conducted by (Asfaw, Argaw, & Bayissa, 2015; Mpofu & Hlatywayo, 2015; Rustiana, 2010; Park & Kang, 2017; Tahir, Yousafzai, Jan, & Hashim, 2014) found that training and development have a significant relationship with employee performance and productivity in both private and government companies. (Ifenkwe, 2012) conducted a study in the State of Abia, Nigeria, on 45 supervisors and 200 agricultural extension agents using Pearson correlation. The results show the extension agents (formal education, training, work experience, reasons for becoming extension agents, childhood experience, and age). Positively and significantly correlated with its performance. Based on this description, the following hypothesis is formulated:

H1. Training has a significant positive effect on employee performance.

Relationship of Training to Job Satisfaction

Employee empowerment, teamwork, and employee training have a significant positive effect on job satisfaction (Hanaysha & Tahir, 2016). A study show a strong positive relationship between job satisfaction with training and development, job rotation, and career development(Khan, Arif, & Rehman, 2015). Authors stated that training and career development are closely related to job satisfaction levels (Wang, Tang, Zhao, Meng, & Liu, 2017). In their research, (Msuya et al., 2017) say the need for more attention in providing training opportunities and career paths to increase job satisfaction. Based on this explanation, the following hypothesis is formulated:

H2. Training has a significant positive effect on job satisfaction.

Relationship between Job Satisfaction and Employee Performance

Empirical studies provide a review of the significant positive relationship between job satisfaction factors and employee performance(Fadlallh, 2015; Ayundasari, Sudiro, & Irawanto, 2017). (Inuwa, 2017) shows that a higher level of satisfaction at work results in a better position, which will automatically result in high performance. (Günay, 2018) states that job satisfaction affects organizational citizenship behavior, while organizational citizenship behavior can affect employee performance. Therefore, job satisfaction can positively affect employee performance. Based on the description above, the following hypothesis can be formulated;

H3. Job satisfaction has a significant positive effect on employee performance.

Relationship of Training to Employee Performance through Job Satisfaction

Almost every company carries out training to improve capabilities and skills to achieve quality employee performance. Research examining the effect of training on employee performance has also been conducted by (Asfaw, Argaw, & Bayissa, 2015; Mpofu & Hlatywayo, 2015; Rustiana, 2010; Sultana, Irum, Ahmed, & Mehmood, 2012; Park & Kang, 2017; Tahir, Yousafzai, Jan, & Hashim, 2014) found that training has a significant relationship with employee performance and productivity in both private and government companies.

Not only that, but some researchers have also further strengthened the notion that high satisfaction will result in increased performance as well. Research that examines the effect of job satisfaction on employee performance has been conducted by (Fadlallh, 2015; Ayundasari, Sudiro, & Irawanto, 2017; Günay, 2018; Inuwa, 2017), which states that job satisfaction has a significant effect on employee performance. Based on this description, the following hypothesis is formulated:

H4. Job satisfaction mediates the effect of training on employee performance.

Figure 1: Research model; Source: Authors

Methodology

This research examines the effect of training variables on employee performance variables both directly and through the mediation of job satisfaction variables. All data in this study will be analyzed using PLS (Partial Least Square) through WarpPLS software. This study uses the C-Step method to test the intervening variables developed by Baron and Kenny (Baron & Kenny, 1986).

Population and Sample

The sample in this study was collected using a census sampling technique with the criteria of Front Liners, who worked for at least one year at PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk Malang City. There are 105 respondents with a valid questionnaire and according to the desired criteria.

Measurement

Data was collected through questionnaires that were measured by Likert Scale. In this study, training was measured by six indicators, according to (Mangkunegara, 2017), namely (1) instructor, (2) Participants, (3) Materials, (4) Methods, (5) Objectives, (6) Objectives. Five indicators measure job satisfaction, according to (Hasibuan, 2009), namely (1) enjoyment of work, (2) love of work, (3) work morale, (4) work discipline, and (5) work performance. At the same time, employee performance is measured by four indicators, according to (Mathis & Jackson, 2002), namely (1) quantity, (2) quality, (3) reliability, and (4) attendance.

Result

The characteristics of the respondents in this study are:

Table 1: Characteristics of the Respondents

Characteristics of Respondents	Total	Percentage
Gender	40	38,1%
- Men	65	61,9%
- Woman		
Age Range		
- 20-25 yrs	44	41,9%
- 26-30 yrs	46	43,8%
- 31-35 yrs	15	14,3%
Education		
- High School	66	62,9%
- Diploma	9	8,6%
- Bachelor	30	28,6%
Marital Status		
- Get Married	73	69,5%
- Single	32	30,5%
Work Unit		
- CSR	11	10,5%
- SGS	94	89,5%
Years of Service		
- 1-4 yrs	69	65,7%
- 5-10 yrs	36	34,3%
Salary	75	71,4%
- >3 – 6 million	30	28,6%
- >6 – 9 million		

The results of the hypothesis analysis on each path obtained from the analysis using WarpPLS are as follows:

Figure 2: Result of structural model; Source: Authors

Table 2 The Result of Direct Influence Test

Exogen	Endogen	Path Coefficient	SE	P-Value (Two-Tailed)	P-Value (One-Tailed)
Training	Employee Performance	0.269	0.091	0.002	0.001
Training	Job Satisfaction	0.234	0.092	0.006	0.003
Job Satisfaction	Employee Performance	0.592	0.083	<0.001	<0.001

Based on figure 2 and table 2, the effect of training on employee performance produces a path coefficient of 0.269 and a p-value (one-tailed) of 0.001. The test results show that the path coefficient is positive and p-value (one-tailed) <level of significance (alpha = 5%). This means that there is a positive and significant effect of training on employee performance. The direct effect coefficient of training on employee performance of 0.269 states that training positively impacts employee performance. This means that the higher the training, it tends to improve employee performance. Statistically, **H1 accepted**.

The effect of training on job satisfaction produces a path coefficient of 0.234 and a p-value (one-tailed) of 0.003. The test results show that the path coefficient is positive and p-value (one-tailed) <level of significance (alpha = 5%). This means that there is a positive and significant effect of training on job satisfaction. The path coefficient (direct result) of training on job satisfaction of 0.234 states that training positively impacts job satisfaction. This means that the more effective the training, it tends to increase job satisfaction. Statistically, **H2 is accepted**.

The effect of job satisfaction on employee performance produces a path coefficient of 0.592 and a p-value (one-tailed) of <0.001. The test results show that the path coefficient is positive and p-value (one-tailed) <level of significance (alpha = 5%). This means that there is a positive and significant effect on job satisfaction on employee performance. The path coefficient (direct impact) on employee performance of 0.592 states that a positive effect on employee performance. This means that higher job satisfaction will tend to improve employee performance. The **H3 statistics count is accepted**.

The Result of Indirect Influence Test

Figure 3a: Indirect Influence

Figure 3b: Direct Influence

Based on the image 3a in the above in mind that the effect of training on job satisfaction that the path coefficient significant, and the influence of gratification of work towards performance s employees produce significant path coefficients. Because both paths are significant, job satisfaction can mediate the effect of training on employee performance.

Based on the test results in Figure 3a, it is known that the effect of training on employee performance is stated to be significant. In Figure 3b, the impact of training on employee performance is indicated to be significant. In contrast, the path coefficient of training effect on employee performance (0.269) in Figure 3a is smaller than the ratio of training on employee performance (0.722) in Figure

3b. It shows that s variable satisfactions work is variables that may mediate part (partial mediation) the impact of training on employee performance.

The following calculation can calculate the path coefficient effect of job satisfaction in mediating training on employee performance:

$$\beta_{(X1 \rightarrow Y1 \rightarrow Y2)} = \beta_{(X1 \rightarrow Y1)} * \beta_{(Y1 \rightarrow Y2)}$$

$$\beta_{(X1 \rightarrow Y1 \rightarrow Y2)} = 0.234 * 0.592 = 0.139$$

Based on the above calculation, the path coefficient influences job. Based on the above calculation, the path coefficient influences job satisfaction in mediating the training on employee performance for 0139 states; the training has a positive effect against the performance of employee's throughs satisfactions work. This means that the higher the job satisfaction that due to increasingly practical training then tend to improve employee performance. **The H4 statistics count is accepted.**

Discussion

The Effect of Training on Employee Performance

The results of this study indicate that training has a significant positive effect on employee performance. These results are consistent with the theory put forward by (Dessler, 2011); namely, training is a method used by companies to provide skills to do work for new employees and active employees at this time.

The results of this study are consistent with previous studies by (Ifenkwe, 2012; Kraja, 2015; Mpofu & Hlatywayo, 2015; Rustiana, 2010; Sasidaran, 2018; Sendawula, Kimuli, Bananuka, & Muganga, 2018; Sultana, Irum, Ahmed, & Mehmood, 2012; Park & Kang, 2017; Tahir, Yousafzai, Jan, & Hashim, 2014). It is known that the training's average value shows a positive value. In the material Indicator (X1.3), get the highest response. This indicates that in the training the material provided was following the objectives of the activities and the needs of the employees.

PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk, does have a variety of training activities tailored to the needs of the employees so that the material provided has also been prepared for the discussion of specific topics and will not be extended to unnecessary talks. This can be interpreted that the implementation of the training held by PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk has run well and proven to be able to improve the performance of employees, especially Front Liners employees.

The Effect of Training on Job Satisfaction

The results showed that training had a significant positive effect on job satisfaction. The results of this study are consistent with previous studies shown by (Awan, Rizwan, Razzaq, & Ali, 2014; Hanaysha & Tahir, 2016; Kelemu, Sime, & Zalalam, 2015; Khan, Arif, & Rehman, 2015; Msuya et al., 2017; Wang, Tang, Zhao, Meng, & Liu, 2017).

Training held by PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk to improve the skills of Front Liners, according to the results of this study, are in the satisfactory category, both in terms of instructors, the material provided, training methods used, goals, and objectives appropriate to the needs, even the trainees themselves. Some changes in Front Liners that reflect satisfaction with the training received include Front Liners individually producing quality work that continues to improve, maintain the fulfillment of work targets every month, always present on time with self-awareness, and handle customer complaints better. They also feel the change to be willing to help encourage and achieve development and self-confidence, always eager to develop the soul to continue to want to learn and reduce fear and worry in trying to do new tasks.

Effect of Job Satisfaction on Employee Performance

The results of this study indicate that job satisfaction has a significant positive effect on employee performance. The results of this study are consistent with previous studies shown by (Fadlallah, 2015; Ayundasari, Sudiro, & Irawanto, 2017; Günay, 2018; Inuwa, 2017).

In this study, it was shown that Front Liners of PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk, is aware of the direction it is headed and understands how to work. In other words, Front Liners like their work because they can do it well. Front Liners don't just like their work but also realize that being a Front Liners is what they want. Front Liners show the values of obedience, obedience, loyalty, order, or order without any element of coercion, pure self-awareness, and the work that is charged to him is always fulfilled. From these results, it can be seen that job satisfaction felt by employees indicates the existence of quality performance.

Effect of Training on Performance by mediating Job Satisfaction

The results showed that job satisfaction mediated the effect of training on employee performance. The impact of job satisfaction mediation is known to be partial mediation. It can be interpreted that job satisfaction can bridge the effect of training on employee performance. Still, satisfaction training can improve the performance of the Front Liners to be even better without any job. This is indicated by an increase in the performance of Front Liners employees because they feel satisfied with the training received and conducted by PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk. Employees are confident because the Company conducts training with material that is needed, teaches stuff with a variety of methods that can be applied in daily work, is guided by competent instructors to meet

expectations, and help Front Liners hone their skills. These employees feel valued and well supervised to bring satisfaction in themselves and more motivation to work better than before.

Implications

The implications in this study are divided into two parts, namely, practical and theoretical substances. The theoretical implication relates to developing research results for further researchers related to training, personality, job satisfaction, and employee performance. The practical implications of providing managerial contributions for the company and employees associated with applying training and personality in influencing employee performance with job satisfaction act as a mediator at PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk Malang City.

Conclusions

Based on the results of the study it can be seen that the training has a significant positive effect on employee performance. The training program that employees participated in was seen as successful by the trainees who were able to apply the training results to real work situations and improve their performance both individually and organizationally. Training must be evaluated by documenting employee performance results and employee behavior at work.

Training has a significant positive effect on job satisfaction. Some changes to Front Liners that reflect satisfaction with the training received include Front Liners individually producing quality work that continues to improve, maintain the fulfillment of work targets every month, always be present on time with self-awareness, and handle customer complaints with increasingly well.

Job satisfaction has a significant positive effect on employee performance. In this study, it was shown that Front Liners of PT. Smartfren Telecom, Tbk, is happy and loves its work. Front Liners not only like their work but realize that being a Front Liners is what they want. Front Liners show signs of loyalty, obedience, orderly without any element of coercion. Front Liners do their work following the SOP set by the Company, and the work achieved in completing their work is always optimal. From these results, it can be seen that job satisfaction felt by employees indicates the existence of quality performance.

Job satisfaction mediates the effect of training on employee performance. The impact of job satisfaction mediation is known to be partial mediation; thus, it can be interpreted that job satisfaction can bridge the effect of training on employee performance. But without any job satisfaction training can improve the performance of Front Liners to be even better.

This research is inseparable from the limitations that cause imperfect research results. The obstacle faced in this research is the distribution of questionnaires. The researcher should be able to distribute it directly and want to while giving a question and answer session. It was still transferred to an online questionnaire because when the questionnaire was being distributed, it coincided with the beginning of the Covid-19 pandemic. The researcher will initially test the hypothesis using SEM-AMOS. Still, in the process, it shows unfavorable and less than optimal results, so the researcher turns to other tests that can maximize the results of this study.

References

- Aragón, M. I. B., Jiménez, D. J., & Valle, R. S. (2014). Training and performance: The mediating role of organizational learning. *BRQ Business Research Quarterly*, 17(3), 161-173. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cede.2013.05.003>
- Asfaw, A. M., Argaw, M. D., & Bayissa, L. (2015). The Impact of Training and Development on Employee Performance and Effectiveness: A Case Study of District Five Administration Office, Bole Sub-City, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *Journal of Human Resource and Sustainability Studies*, 3, 188–202. <https://doi.org/10.4236/jhrss.2015.34025>
- Awan, M. A., Rizwan, M., Razzaq, J. B., & Ali, U. (2014). Factors Affecting Employee Satisfaction in the Private Organizations of Bahawalpur Pakistan. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 4(2), 147. <https://doi.org/10.5296/ijhrs.v4i2.5904>
- Ayundasari, D. Y., Sudiro, A., & Irawanto, D. W. (2017). Improving Employee Performance Through Work Motivation and Self-Efficacy Mediated By Job Satisfaction. *Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen*, 15(4), 587–599. <https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.jam2017.015.04.05>
- Baron, R. M., & Kenny, D. A. (1986). The moderator–mediator variable distinction in social psychological research: Conceptual, strategic, and statistical considerations. *Journal of personality and social psychology*, 51(6), 1173. <https://doi.org/DOI:10.1037/0022-3514.51.6.1173>
- Dessler, G. (2011). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Edisi 10). Jakarta: Indeks.
- Fadlallah, A. W. A. (2015). Impact of job satisfaction on employees performance an application on faculty of science and humanity studies university of Salman Bin Abdul-Aziz-Al Aflaj. *International Journal of Innovation and Research in Educational Sciences*, 2(1), 26-32.
- Günay, G. Y. (2018). Relationship between job satisfaction, organizational citizenship behavior and employee performance: Sample of Edirne financial office employees in Turkey. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research*, 8(1), 64-74.
- Hanaysha, J., & Tahir, P. R. (2016). Examining the Effects of Employee Empowerment, Teamwork, and Employee Training on Job Satisfaction. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 219, 272–282. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2016.05.016>
- Hasibuan, H. (2009). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia* (Edisi 13). Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.

- Ifenkwe, G. E. (2012). Agent-Related Factors Affecting the Performance of Agricultural Extension Staff in Abia State, Nigeria. *Journal of Agricultural Sciences*, 3(1), 45–48. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09766898.2012.11884684>
- Inuwa, M. (2017). Relationship between Job Equity and Performance of Employee: A Literature Review. *International Journal of Business and Management Future*, 1(1), 8–15. <https://doi.org/10.46281/ijbmf.v1i1.110>
- Kelemu, K., Sime, M., Hailu, M., & Zalalam, T. (2015). Determinants and Levels of Agricultural Development Agents Job Satisfaction: The Case of Kalu Woreda, South Wollo Zone of the Amhara National Regional State. *Ethiopian Journal of Business and Economics (The)*, 4(1), 149. <https://doi.org/10.4314/ejbe.v4i1.5>
- Khan, R. A., Arif, A., & Rehman, A. (2015). Impact of Training and Development practices on Employees Job satisfaction at Pakistan International Airline. In *IBT Journal of Business Studies*, 11(1), 145–159. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.46745/ilma.ibtjbs.2015.111.11>
- Kraja, G. (2015). Training, development and Performance (Case study of the Albanian Public Administration). *Journal of Sociological Research*, 6(1), 129–140. <https://doi.org/10.5296/jsr.v6i1.7905>
- Mangkunegara, A. A. P. (2017). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Bandung: Remaja Rosda Karya.
- Mathis, R. L., Jackson, J. H. (2002). *Human Resources Management: Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (Terjemahan)*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- MburuMaina, P., & Waithaka, P. (2017). Effect of on-the-job training on performance of the Kenya police service. *IOSR Journal of Business and Management*, 19(9), 64–71. <https://doi.org/10.9790/487X-1909076471>
- Mpofu, M., & Hlatywayo, C. K. (2015). Training and development as a tool for improving basic service delivery; the case of a selected municipality. *Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Science*, 20(39), 133–136. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jefas.2015.10.004>
- Msuya, C. P., Annor-Frempong, F. K., Magheni, M. N., Agunga, R., Igodan, C., Ladele, A. A., ... & Zwane, E. (2017). The role of agricultural extension in Africa's development, the importance of extension workers and the need for change. *International Journal of Agricultural Extension*, 5(1), 51–58.
- Robbins, S., Judge, T. (2017). *Perilaku Organisasi*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- Rustiana, A. (2010). Efektivitas Pelatihan bagi Peningkatan Kinerja Karyawan. *Jurnal Dinamika Manajemen*, 1(2), 137–143. <https://doi.org/10.15294/jdm.v1i2.2469>
- Sasidaran, S. (2018). Impact of Training on Employee Performance: A Case Study of Private Organization in Sri Lanka. *IOSR Journal of Business and Management*, e-ISSN, 13–21.
- Sendawula, K., Kimuli, S. N., Bananuka, J., & Muganga, G. N. (2018). Training, employee engagement and employee performance: Evidence from Uganda's health sector. *Cogent Business & Management*, 5(1), 1470891. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2018.1470891>
- Sultana, A., Irum, S., Ahmed, K., & Mehmood, N. (2012). Impact of training on employee performance: A study of telecommunication sector in Pakistan. *Interdisciplinary Journal of contemporary research in business*, 4(6), 646–661.
- Park, S., Kim, E. J., & Kang, H. S. (2017). Does Supervisor Support Make a Difference in Employees' Training and Job Performance?. In *Academy of Management Proceedings* (Vol. 2017, No. 1, p. 11418). Briarcliff Manor, NY 10510: Academy of Management. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.5465/AMBPP.2017.11418abstract>
- Tahir, N., Yousafzai, I. K., Jan, S., & Hashim, M. (2014). The Impact of Training and Development on Employees Performance and Productivity A case study of United Bank Limited Peshawar City, KPK, Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 4(4), 86. <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v4-i4/756>
- Wang, H., Tang, C., Zhao, S., Meng, Q., & Liu, X. (2017). Job satisfaction among health-care staff in township health centers in rural China: Results from a latent class analysis. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 14(10), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph14101101>