Business & Social Science
IJRBS

Research in Business & Social Science

IJRBS VOL 8 NO 6 ISSN: 2147-4478

Available online at www.ssbfn.net
Journal homepage: <https://www.ssbfn.net/ojs/index.php/ijrbs>

Labor market and management of gender based decision making: Kosovo case study

Bashkim Bellaqa^a, Xhavit Shala^{b*}, Dea Bellaqa^c

^aFaculty of Economics, University of Mitrovica "Isa Boletini", Mitrovica, Republic of Kosovo

^{b,c}Pristina, Republic of Kosovo

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 11 September 2019

Received in revised form 23 Sept. 2019

Accepted 27 September 2019

Keywords:

Labor Market

Labor Management

Decision

Labor Economics Policies

JEL Classification:

J20

M54

MOO

JO8

ABSTRACT

Improving gender equality in decision-making is a very important issue in a country's economic development. The main purpose of the research is to analyze the level of central level decision making and the alignment of the labor market at Kosovo level on gender basis. Also, this paper presents a theoretical focus on the role of decision making for a better service and the possible management of gender equality counseling programs in the economic, political and social spheres. Kosovo continues to face challenges as well as a marked disparity in women's disadvantage in regards to managing the gender-based decision-making process at both the central and the local level. Although there are laws that stimulate gender equality, the position of women in decision-making in public life in terms of contributing to economic, political and social development endeavors are lacking their increase in participation and decision-making at both central and local levels

© 2019 Bussecon International Academy. Hosting by SSBFNET. All rights reserved.

Peer review under responsibility of Bussecon International Academy & SSBFNET.

Introduction

Increasing the quality of the management of gender equality decision-making is one of the essential values of a modern society. Economic empowerment of gender equality is one of the key issues in economic development as well as in improving the well-being of the population. In terms of gender equality this refers to women and men having equal opportunities, such as economic, political, social, etc., where it can be said that in this regard the Republic of Kosovo has signed a considerable number of important mandatory documents at the international level, which guarantee gender equality and prohibit gender-based discrimination, in particular the Council of Europe's Social Charter, the European Convention on Human Rights, the United Nations Convention (UN) on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). Guaranteeing equal participation of women and men in all areas of life, equal position, equal opportunities. Central and local level Institutions in Kosovo should have adequate management in taking more affirmative measures that lead to achieving gender equality such as gender quotas or similar decision-making measures. According to the population analysis by gender, the gender proportion of the population in Kosovo is equal, but based on the analysis of representation data, we see it is disadvantageous to women in managerial positions, since women are not equal in economic, political decision-making; although they have a significant impact on economic development. Women are less represented in decision-making compared to men. Men at senior management level including ministerial positions account for about 94.4% while the share of women in senior management positions at ministerial level is small or about 5.6 %. The state should devote an important role in improving the economic situation for women and improving their economic status. The greater involvement of women in the

* Corresponding author. Tel: +383- 49- 424121 ORCID ID: x

Peer review under responsibility of Bussecon International Academy.

© 2019 Bussecon International. Hosting by SSBFNET- Center for Strategic Studies in Business & Finance. All rights reserved.

<https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v8i6.521>

economy, politics and their support in decision-making management positions at both central and local levels the more women will affect economic development and the creation of more sustainable social stability. In Kosovo, labor market incomes and outputs are highly disparate, taking into account the young age of the population and the small number of job creation, of, which results in a high unemployment rate, especially for females in rural areas. Kosovo has made very little improvements in terms of gender equality in decision-making institutions at central and local level, where the same situation has been followed within the labor market. The purpose of this research is to analyze and compare on a year-by-year basis the situation of gender-based decision-making as well as the situation of female and male participation in the labor market by employment rate, unemployment, economic activities, etc. Also, a special overview in this paper is given to policies that affect gender equality, etc. The purpose of this study is to analyze and determine the main indicators that influence the decision-making process and the gender market in Kosovo. The study is organized as follows: The first part consists of the introductory section providing brief information related to the study and a review of the literature related to the study. The second part presents the research methodology, which presents the analysis of gender-based decision-making and the labor market over the years, as well as the analysis of policy management and programs in Kosovo related to gender equality in decision-making, and in the labor market. At the end, the findings of the study and the literature used in this study have also been presented.

Literature Review

Decision making, Labor market and Performance theory

The literature review is important for understanding the discussions, debates on the process of managerial decision-making applicability as part of economic, political and social processes. Gender equality represents a crucial value for society, so society needs to invest in the achievement of gender equality. In the last two decades, although there has been progress in terms of gender equality, there is still a need for greater improvement in the labor market at both the national and global level, where gender disparities still exist for women. The participation of women, as part of the workforce as a whole, has remained low compared to men, women being in a poor situation, including that in their employment cases, women also face significant wage differences compared to men. (MFI, 2013). In order to provide a more comprehensive overview of approaches to implementation theories, support must be provided throughout the implementation process by stakeholders as well as by the legislative and executive branch.(Myrphy, J., 1973).

Analyzing different implementation theories, this study aims to identify and evidence the implementation challenges and attempts to provide suggestions on the approach that could bring about full policy implementation. Studies confirm the importance and crucial role of implementing officials, who must have appropriate capacities in utilizing available resources and be committed to achieving policy objectives (Lipsky, M., 1971). The gender equality of men and women in economic decision-making processes also reflects the level of political maturity of a social environment. According to many studies conducted, when women are active participants in the labor market, the state has many benefits in the field of the economy of the country. The creation of gender equality opportunities has progressively impacted the country's economic, social and political development. Agenda-setting should serve to identify the problem, create policy and decision-making proposals and select a solution, implement the policy for the solution to take effect, and evaluate the policy through the results of monitoring. (Hill, M., & Hupe, P., 2002). One of the most difficult labour market challenges facing the world economy are gender gaps. In actuality, women have comparatively lower probability than men to participate in the labour market, i.e. for employment or job seeking: the current global labour force participation rate for women is nearly 27% lower than the rate for men; with no change for the better in 2018. It is of concern that underlying this gap is a downward trend in participation rates for both men and women; the participation rates for both sexes have fallen close to 3%, during 1997-2017. The gap in some countries has been closing as a result of male rates falling more sharply compared to female rates (International Labour Office, 2017). Heterogeneity in gender terms is also applicable in the aspect of policy. Laws enforcing more female representation would greatly help women reach top level positions. Although the gender gap has been narrowing when it comes to educational attainment and achievement, women with the same education and experience as men are under represented in senior positions (Women in Management, 2018).

Research and Methodology

For developing the objectives of this research paper, a very extensive literature dealing with the field of gender equality in economic and decision-making has been utilized, as well as data from primary and secondary sources including studies that were previously conducted as well as case studies in the field of gender equality, statistical data, data from sources in credible electronic form by credible institutions at local and international level. This article presents the theoretical aspect of decision making at central level managerial decision-making institutions in Kosovo and comparative analyzes on the labor market on gender related to employment, unemployment over the years. The theoretical aspect has been addressed through the use of extensive contemporary literature, including scientific research in the field of gender equality in decision-making as well as in the labor market. Mixed method is defined as the procedure of collecting, analyzing and integrating quantitative and qualitative data into a general research goal (Bryman, 2006; Creswell & Plano Clark, 2007). In the preparation of this paper we are faced with a lack of data both in breadth and depth of research. Also, comparative methods have been applied by comparing gender equality across years in terms of employment, unemployment, decision-making at management levels, etc.

Gender-based decision making at central and local level in Kosovo

Regarding gender participation in senior management positions at senior management levels; at central level (in ministerial institutions) and local leadership level (at municipal level) in Kosovo based on 2014 data analysis, we find a disadvantageous situation for women, with women being less represented in decision making than men. Men participate in senior management positions, including ministerial positions, representing around 94.4 %, while female participation in ministerial positions is quite low or around 5.6 %. For the leadership positions in the capacity of deputy minister we also have an unfavorable situation for women, with female participation in the position of deputy minister around 2.9 % and men 97.1 % (Agency for Gender Equality, 2014). As for the employees in decision-making positions in the Presidency, Parliament and Ministries within the Government of Kosovo we can see in Table 1.

Table 1. Employees in decision-making positions by the Ministry, Assembly of Kosovo and Presidency 2017

Ministry, Assembly of Kosovo and Presidency	High leading level		Leading level	
	Women	Men	Women	Men
Office of the Prime Minister	1	8	38	84
Ministry of Trade and Industry	1	6	15	32
Ministry of Health	1	4	36	41
Ministry of Culture, Youth and Sports	0	2	20	41
Ministry of Transport	0	1	4	35
Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare	0	4	15	73
Ministry of Public Administration	1	2	10	25
Ministry of Education, Science and Technology	2	9	28	52
Ministry of Economy and Finance	0	4	52	175
Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Rural Development	0	3	13	52
Ministry of Economic Development	0	2	9	24
Ministry of Local Government Administration	0	1	8	13
Ministry of Environment and Spatial Planning	0	3	22	37
Ministry of Foreign Affairs	0	3	4	20
Ministry of Justice	0	5	21	80
Ministry of the Kosovo Security Force	0	1	9	27
Ministry of Internal Affairs	0	4	39	135
Ministry of Diaspora	0	1	4	14
Ministry of European Integration	0	2	8	15
Ministry of Communities and Returns	0	1	3	11
Assembly of Kosovo	0	3	19	28
The Presidency	0	1	14	17
Total	6	70	391	1031
%	8	92	27	73

Source: Data presented in tabular form by the authors taken from the gender statistics report published by MPA for 2017

Based on the data analyzed, it appears that at senior management levels including the Presidency, Parliament and the Ministry, about 92% of senior management are male, while 8% are female. Regarding employees at managerial levels based on data analysis, it appears that the position of women is slightly better, but there is still a significant discrepancy, where female employment is about 27% while men about 73%. % (MPA, 2017). Figure 1. Employee data by management levels for 2017 is also shown in the graph.

Figure 1: Leading posts in ministries, executive agencies and at the local level administration for 2015 and 2017

Source: Ministry of Public Administration (2017) Gender equality report

Regarding the trends of participation of women in decision-making positions at the municipal level, there are improvements if compared to 2008 and 2014, while at the ministerial level there is no improvement in trends, which can be noticed on the figure below. Regarding the trends of participation of women in decision-making positions at the municipal level, there is no improvement when compared to 2008 and 2014, while at the ministerial level there is an improvement in trends, which can be seen in Figure 2 below.

Figure 2. Trends of female participation in decision-making positions 2008 - 2014 in the Ministry and Municipality expressed in %

Source: Analyzed data on women's participation in decision-making positions at central and local level based on DCSA data 2008 -2014

Gender-based analysis of the labor market in Kosovo

Adequate skills for both men and women play an important role in job creation, which requires high level skills and knowledge. It is not enough for us as a society or state to have only one workforce, but it is essential that the workforce is adequately trained in the labor market in line with market economy trends. Analyzes show that labor market revenues and outputs in Kosovo have a large discrepancy between labor market revenues and outputs, as we have a young population or a third of the population under the age of 15, job creation is quite small and this results especially in a high unemployment rate for women. In 2014, the working age population in Kosovo, including the age group of 15-64 years old, was 1,202,489 inhabitants, of which 41.6% were active, or expressed in numerical values 500,251 inhabitants, that were economically active. Of this active population we have 35.3% unemployed, or 167,743 persons, while 26.9% or 323 employed (Bellaqa.,B., 2015). Whereas according to the latest data from the Labor Force Survey (LFS), it results that we have 1,198,273 working-age population in Kosovo, out of this population there is 708,170 inactive population, with the majority being women around 487,840. Employment as well as female unemployment in previous years and in recent years is in a bad situation. Regarding the classification of the labor market for the population of Kosovo for 2018, you can see Figure 3.

Figure 3: Classification of the labor market for the population of Kosovo, 2018**Source:** Kosovo Statistical Agency (2018) Labor Force Survey

The labor market data on employment and unemployment on a gender basis, expressed as a percentage, show that 28.8% of the total working age population is employed. The employment rate for men is about 45.3%, while for women the employment rate is 12.3%. Regarding unemployment by gender, it turns out that the unemployment rate is more pronounced among females with 33.4%, compared to males, with males having an unemployment rate of about 28.5%. In 2017 as shown in Figure 3 the inactive power was quite high or expressed as a percentage of about 59.1%, but this inactive power was more concentrated in females or about 81.6%, while less in males, or around 36.7% (LFS, 2018).

Table 2: Employees by activity and gender expressed in% for 2018

Economic activity (NACE REV2)	Males	Females	Total
Agriculture, forestry and fishing	4.2	1	3.5
Mining and quarrying	1.1	0.1	0.9
Manufacturing	11.4	6.1	10.3
Electricity, gas, steam and air conditioning supply	2.3	0.1	1.8
Water supply, sewerage, waste management	1.5	0.4	1.3
Construction	14.8	1.2	11.9
Wholesale and retail trade; repair of motor vehicles	16.8	17.7	17
Transportation and storage	3.8	1.4	3.3
Accommodation and food service activities	7.7	3.6	6.9
Information and communication	3.5	3.2	3.4
Financial and insurance activities	1.7	3.2	2
Real estate activities	0.1	0	0.1
Professional, scientific and technical activities	1.5	2.6	1.8
Administrative and support service activities	2.9	2.8	2.9
Public administration and defense, compulsory social security	7.1	6.5	7
Education	8.5	21.8	11.3
Human health and social work activities	3.7	13.5	5.8
Arts, entertainment and recreation	1.5	0.8	1.3
Other service activities	4.8	5.2	4.8
*Activities of households as employers	0.4	6.8	1.7
Activities of extraterritorial organizations and bodies	0.7	2	1
Total	100	100	100

Source: Analysis of employment activities by activities based on LFS data for 2018

Based on Table 2. it is noted that the activities that have mainly absorbed employment are education, health and trade, while other activities have less female employees. Employment by economic activity is also shown in Figure 4. It is observed that the economic activities that have absorbed the most employment are trade, construction, education and production.

Figure 4. Employees by activity and gender expressed in% for 2018

Source: Graphic presentation of data by authors based on LFS data for 2018

Based on gender-based employment analyzes from 2013 to 2018, it can be seen that there was a slight improvement in female employment rates in 2013 and 2017, as you can see in Figure 5.

Figure 5: Employment rate by gender 2013 - 2018 expressed in%

Source: Data processed and analyzed by the authors based on LFS data for the period 2013 - 2018

Comparing the employment rate between 2013 and 2018 between men and women, women in Kosovo face lower employment rate compared to men, with female employment trends ranging from 11.5% to 12.9%, it is noted that there is a very low rate of female employment. In the aspect of ownership there's also an adverse situation for women, where according to the results of the Household Budget Survey (HBS) we see that from 2012 to 2017, male ownership is over 88% (HBS, 2017). This can be seen in Figure 6.

Figure 6. Gender ownership for the period 2012 - 2017 expressed in %

Source: Data analyzed by the authors, based on HBS data for the period 2012-2017 published by KAS

Management of policies and programs in Kosovo for the creation of gender equality in employment

In the Constitution of the Republic of Kosovo, gender equality is considered a fundamental value of society, stating that 'the Republic of Kosovo provides gender equality as a fundamental value for the democratic development of society, equal opportunities for participation of women and men in political, economic, social life, cultural and other areas of social life', sustainable management of policies and programs will increase women's access to the labor market, senior management positions, etc. One of the Millennium Development Goals presented by the UN is women's empowerment and gender equality, this objective is very challenging to meet in Kosovo, taking into account the stage of economic development, the cultural aspect, the discrimination in the market existing towards women, etc. Providing quality employment services, active employment policy measures through the Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare (MLSW) and other relevant institutions will contribute to improving the economic participation of women. MLSW is currently facing limited human and budgetary capacities, in which the department needs to strengthen the capacity of public employment services in order to provide services in terms of capacity building of additional labor skills and capacity building for employment mediation, where the effects of regional offices within the MLSW on employment mediation are quite small. In the area of vocational training, the focus will be on improving the quality of program management in line with the needs of the labor market economy. Participation in the labor market in Kosovo should be equal for both men and women. In higher-skilled workplaces, women are faced with additional restrictions, such as: childcare, therefore, that also poses a challenge to female employment. The development of childcare systems and the expansion of these services will affect the creation of job opportunities for women (World Bank Group, 2015).

Findings

Based on the analysis of gender-based decision-making during the period 2012-2017 in Kosovo, it results that decision-making at high ministerial levels is unfavorable for women, with women participating with around 5.6% to 8%, where compared to men, women employment in senior management positions is quite small. Also, the analysis of the labor market trend based on gender turns out to be disadvantageous for females both in terms of employment rate, inactive economic power, employment by economic activity etc. According to the latest data, the situation of labor indicators is disadvantageous for women, with 12.3% female employment rate, 81.6% inactivity, 33.4% unemployment rate, etc. In Kosovo, although there are laws that encourage gender equality so that women can participate in public life and to contribute to social development, there is still lacking in the increase of the participation of women in decision-making at both central and local levels. Analyzes show that the country has not done much in advancing women in decision-making positions and in improving the labor market in terms of gender although there are laws signed by the Government in this regard as well as initiatives taken by both policy makers and other relevant organizations. The labor market and administration policies at central and local level are not yet in place, so they need proper monitoring; not just on paper. Based on the political analysis, it is noted that the Government of Kosovo has not yet developed satisfactory policies that improve the gender balance in terms of decision making as well as employment and unemployment, etc. The unfavorable situation of women is also found in the ownership aspect where over 88% of the property is owned by men, as well as at all levels of education, with the exception of pre-school and primary education with a slight advantage of employment of women compared to men, etc.

Conclusions

Sustainable policies in the field of economy and administration at central and local level should be developed to improve the current state of women's managerial decision-making and to improve the labor market balance on gender equality. Promoting and

encouraging the achievement of gender equality and in particular the promotion of women's participation in managerial positions in decision-making play an important role in advancing women's decision-making whether in public or private life. Increasing the quality of the management of gender equality decision-making is one of the essential values of a modern democratic society. The level of women's participation in decision-making and the high leadership positions of a society largely depend on the socio-economic position of that country. Based on the analysis of this research paper it is noticed that there is no gender balance between males and females, where we see that the situation of females is unfavorable in senior management positions at both central and local level, then we have an unfavorable situation for women in the labor market both in employment and economic activity. Although there are improvements in the legal infrastructure for gender equality, reality speaks differently, where the labor market in Kosovo reflects gender inequality in employment, with women being less employed in management positions at both central and local levels, as well as in the private sector. The election law sets the quota of 30% of women's participation in the legislature at central and local level, but there is no other law that sets the rate of participation for other institutions as well. There should be more initiatives for the advancement of women's decision-making in the economy, politics as well as the advancement of women in leadership positions, these initiatives need to be taken by the Ministry of Labor and Social Welfare (MLSW) and other relevant institutions. The recommendations given by this paper convey that the state should do more to strengthen country-level mechanisms that contribute to gender equality in order to promote women's participation in decision-making and to improve the gender balance of the labor market. Advancement of legal infrastructure at national level with standards and requirements deriving from international level in order to better address gender needs in society. Empowering of women in decision-making by increasing their participation at central and local levels. Ensuring economic and social empowerment of gender equality by addressing gender inequalities. The publishing of statistics and reports on an ongoing basis, as well as in a more detailed way by the institutions dealing with the publication of statistics, and the making of a database accessible to interested parties on the Internet; for women need the Government respectively MLSW, to invest more in training, entrepreneurship, etc. Then removing the existing gender stereotypes and the creation of equal opportunities in the labor market for both men and women, etc.

References

- Agency for Gender Equality. (2014). Reports and research, Prishtina, Ministry of Public Administration, 45. <https://abgj.rks-gov.net/publikimet/106/raporte-dhe-hulumtime>
- Bellaqa, B. (2015). Kosova, vendi me më pak të punësuar në rajon. Koha ditore, 1 - 2. <<https://www.koha.net> >
- Creswell, J. & Plano Clark, V. (2007). Designing and Conducting Mixed Methods Research, 801. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1094428108318066>
- Elborgh-Woytek, K. Newiak, M. Kochhar, K. Fabrizio, S. Kpodar, K. Wingender, Ph. Clements, B. & Schwartz, G. (2013). Women, Work, and the Economy: Macroeconomic Gains From Gender Equity, 4. file:///C:/Users/User22/Downloads/_sdn1310.pdf
- HBS. (2017). Results of Household Budget Survey, Prishtina, Kosovo Agency of Statistics, June, 2018,25. <http://ask.rks-gov.net/media/4169/results-of-the-household-budget-2017.pdf>
- Hill, M. & Hupe, P. (2002). Implementating Public Policy: Governance in Theory and in Practice. SAGE Publications Ltd; First edition, 16. <https://www.amazon.co.uk>
- IMF. (2013). Strategy, Policy, and Review Department and Fiscal Affairs Department: Women, Work, and the Economy: Macroeconomic Gains from Gender Equity. Prepared by Katrin Elborgh-Woytek, Monique. <https://www.imf.org/en/Publications/Staff-Discussion-Notes/Issues/2016/12/31/Women-Work-and-the-Economy-Macroeconomic-Gains-from-Gender-Equity-40915>
- International Labour Office. (2017). ILO World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends for women 2017, 4. https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---inst/documents/publication/wcms_557245.pdf
- LFS. (2018). Labour Force Survey, Prishtina, Kosovo Agency of Statistics, April, 2019, 22. <http://ask.rks-gov.net/media/5026/labour-force-survey-2018.pdf>
- Lipsky, M. (1971). Street level bureaucracy and the analysis of urban reform. Urban Affairs Quarterly No 6, 391-409. <https://doi.org/10.1177/107808747100600401>
- MPA – DASHC. (2015). Raport për gjendjen e shërbyesve civil në Kosovë. Prishtinë, Ministria e Administratës Publike. <https://map.rks-gov.net/desk/inc/media/46EAB4DC-1D34-4789-8C62-CDB74178AA07.pdf>
- MPA. (2017). Gender Report, Prishtina, Ministry of Public Administration. <http://abgj.rks.spinagency.com/rreth-abgj/103/ministore-dhe-komunale>
- Myrphy, J. (1973). The Education Bureaucracies Implement Novel Policy: The Politics of Title 1 of ESEA, in A. Sindler (ed), Policy and Politics in America, Boston: Little Brown, 160 -199. <https://books.google.com/books>
- World Bank Group. (2015). Kosovo jobs diagnostic, 79. <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/814361497466817941/pdf/ACS21442-WP-PUBLIC-ADD-SERIES-KosovoJDWEB.pdf>
- Women in Management. (2018). Women in business report: building a blueprint for action, 2019. <https://www.grantthornton.global/en/insights/women-in-business-2019/women-in-business-report-2019/>